Intermittent fasting and weight loss

Systematic review

Stephanie Welton MSc Robert Minty MD CCFP FCFP Teresa O'Driscoll MD FCFP Hannah Willms Denise Poirier RPN Sharen Madden MD MSc FCFP Len Kelly MD MclinSci FCFP FRRM

Abstract

Objective To examine the evidence for intermittent fasting (IF), an alternative to calorie-restricted diets, in treating obesity, an important health concern in Canada with few effective office-based treatment strategies.

Data sources A MEDLINE and EMBASE search from January 1, 2000, to July 1, 2019, yielded 1200 results using the key words fasting, time restricted feeding, meal skipping, alternate day fasting, intermittent fasting, and reduced meal frequency.

Study selection Forty-one articles describing 27 trials addressed weight loss in overweight and obese patients: 18 small randomized controlled trials (level I evidence) and 9 trials comparing weight after IF to baseline weight with no control group (level II evidence). Studies were often of short duration (2 to 26 weeks) with low enrolment (10 to 244 participants); 2 were of 1-year duration. Protocols varied, with only 5 studies including patients with type 2 diabetes.

Synthesis All 27 IF trials found weight loss of 0.8% to 13.0% of baseline weight with no serious adverse events. Twelve studies comparing IF to calorie restriction found equivalent results. The 5 studies that included patients with type 2 diabetes documented improved glycemic control.

Conclusion Intermittent fasting shows promise for the treatment of obesity. To date, the studies have been small and of short duration. Longer-term research is needed to understand the sustainable role IF can play in weight loss.

Editor's key points

- In all 27 trials examined, intermittent fasting (IF) resulted in weight loss, ranging from 0.8% to 13.0% of baseline body weight. Weight loss occurred regardless of changes in overall caloric intake. In the studies of 2 to 12 weeks' duration, body mass index decreased, on average, by 4.3% to a median of 33.2 kg/m². Symptoms such as hunger remained stable or decreased, and no adverse events were reported.
- ▶ While IF is a moderately successful strategy for weight loss, it shows promise for improving glycemic control, although it does pose a potential risk of hypoglycemia.
- ▶ The heterogeneity in the current evidence limits comparison of IF to other weight-loss strategies. Intermittent fasting shows promise as a primary care intervention for obesity, but little is known about long-term sustainability and health effects. Longer-duration studies are needed to understand how IF might contribute to effective weight-loss strategies.

Points de repère du rédacteur

- Dans l'ensemble des 27 études examinées, le jeûne intermittent (JI) s'est traduit par une perte pondérale allant de 0,8 à 13,0 % du poids corporel au départ. La perte pondérale s'est produite quels que soient les changements dans l'apport calorique global. Dans les études d'une durée de 2 à 12 semaines, l'indice de masse corporelle a connu une baisse, en moyenne, de 4,3% à une réduction médiane de 33,2 kg/m². Les symptômes, comme la faim, sont demeurés stables ou ont diminué, et aucun événement indésirable n'a été rapporté.
- ▶ Si le JI est une stratégie qui connaît un succès modéré en ce qui concerne la perte pondérale, elle se révèle prometteuse pour améliorer le contrôle glycémique, quoiqu'elle comporte un risque potentiel d'hypoglycémie.
- L'hétérogénéité des données probantes actuelles limite les possibilités de comparer le JI à d'autres stratégies de perte de poids. Le jeûne intermittent est prometteur en tant qu'intervention en soins primaires pour l'obésité, mais sa durabilité et ses effets sur la santé à long terme sont peu connus. Des études plus prolongées sont nécessaires pour comprendre comment le JI pourrait contribuer à l'efficacité des stratégies de perte pondérale.

Jeûne intermittent et perte de poids

Revue systématique

Stephanie Welton MSc Robert Minty MD CCFP FCFP Teresa O'Driscoll MD FCFP Hannah Willms Denise Poirier RPN Sharen Madden MD MSc FCFP Len Kelly MD MclinSci FCFP FRRM

Résumé

Objectif Examiner les données probantes concernant le jeûne intermittent (JI) comme solution de rechange aux régimes faibles en calories dans le traitement de l'obésité, une importante préoccupation en matière de santé au Canada, compte tenu de la rareté des stratégies thérapeutiques efficaces applicables en clinique.

Sources des données Une recherche documentaire effectuée dans MEDLINE et EMBASE, du 1er janvier 2000 au 1er juillet 2019, a produit 1200 résultats à l'aide des expressions clés suivantes: fasting, time restricted feeding, meal skipping, alternate day fasting, intermittent fasting et reduced meal frequency.

Sélection des études Quelque 41 articles décrivant 27 études portaient sur la perte de poids chez les patients en surpoids et obèses:18 petites études randomisées contrôlées (données probantes de niveau I) et 9 études comparant le poids après un JI avec le poids au point de départ et sans groupe témoin (données probantes de niveau II). Les études étaient souvent de courte durée (de 2 à 26 semaines), et la participation était peu nombreuse (de 10 à 244 sujets); 2 études ont duré 1 an. Les protocoles variaient, et seulement 5 études incluaient des patients atteints de diabète de type 2.

Synthèse Dans les 27 études sur le JI, une perte pondérale variant de 0,8 à 13 % s'est produite sans événements indésirables sérieux. Douze études comparant le JI et la restriction de calories ont fait valoir des résultats équivalents. Les 5 études qui comptaient des patients atteints de diabète de type 2 ont documenté un meilleur contrôle glycémique.

Conclusion Le jeûne intermittent semble prometteur pour le traitement de l'obésité. Jusqu'à présent, les études comptaient peu de sujets et étaient de courte durée. Des recherches à plus long terme sont nécessaires pour comprendre le rôle durable que peut jouer le JI dans la perte pondérale.

n 2018, 63.1% of Canadian adults were overweight or obese.1 Obesity is a risk factor for cardiovascular disease and type 2 diabetes.^{2,3} As obesity rates climb, there is increasing focus on dietary interventions, the most common being calorie-restricted diets, which achieve initial but often unsustained weight loss.4 There is recent interest in the use of fasting for the treatment of obesity⁵⁻⁷ and diabetes.8,9 Intermittent fasting (IF) refers to regular periods with no or very limited caloric intake. It commonly consists of a daily fast for 16 hours, a 24-hour fast on alternate days, or a fast 2 days per week on non-consecutive days.8 During fasting, caloric consumption often ranges from zero to 25% of caloric needs. Consumption on nonfasting days might be ad libitum, restricted to a certain diet composition, or aimed to reach a specific caloric intake of up to 125% of regular caloric needs.9 Various terms are used to describe regular intermittent calorie abstention, including intermittent fasting, alternate-day fasting, reduced meal frequency, and time-restricted feeding. Intermittent fasting can be used with unrestricted consumption when not fasting or in conjunction with other dietary interventions. This review provides the most recent evidence on IF's effects on weight loss and the potential role it plays in primary care treatment of obesity.

- Data sources —

An EMBASE and MEDLINE search of articles from January 1, 2000, to July 1, 2019, returned 1200 unique results using the key words alternate day fasting, intermittent fasting, fasting, time restricted feeding, meal skipping, and reduced meal frequency. We included English-language studies that focused on weight loss for overweight and obese participants (body mass index [BMI] of $\geq 25 \text{ kg/m}^2$) and excluded studies of very short duration (<2 weeks), studies of those requiring inpatient treatment, or studies focused on stroke, seizures, or other specific medical conditions. Following these exclusions 41 articles remained, describing 27 unique experiments: 18 small randomized controlled trials (level I evidence) and 9 trials comparing weight after IF to baseline weight with no control group (level II evidence) (Table 1). 10-50 Levels of evidence are classified according to the Canadian Task Force on Preventive Health Care.

— Synthesis ——

Study design

Study interventions incorporated IF in a variety of ways, from a 24-hour fast several days per week (eg, the "5 and 2" protocol) 11,16,17,21,27,28,35,41,42,50 to a daily 16-hour fast. 10,12,25,34 The most common study design was to alternate 24-hour periods of fasting with unrestricted consumption (alternating fast and feast days). 13,15,19,20,22-24,29,33,38,43,47,49 Study protocols also varied in their recommendations on caloric intake, enrolment of patients with diabetes, presence of a control group, and study duration. Some studies restricted calories while others allowed ad libitum consumption when not fasting. The rigour of fasting also varied, with several studies allowing 25% of regular caloric consumption during fasting periods. Comparator groups to IF diets followed a usual diet13,20,25,43,49 or calorie-restricted diet. 11,15-17,19,22,27,28,33,41-43

While patients with diabetes were commonly excluded (Table 2), 10,11,13,15,19-25,27-29,32,33,35,37,38,40-43,47,49,50 5 studies enrolled only those with type 2 diabetes (n=174 patients) (Table 3). 12,16,17,21,34 In both diabetic and nondiabetic populations, cardiovascular risk factors were reduced. When diet composition was controlled, most protocols were consistent with Health Canada and American Heart Association guidelines at the time: 55% carbohydrates, 20% fat, and 25% protein.51,52 The most common alternative was unrestricted consumption. An enrichment of protein was considered in 5 studies at the expense of carbohydrate intake. 12,15,16,28,50 Two followed a Mediterranean-type diet. 27,42 Fat consumption was examined in 1 study, which compared dietary fat intake of 45% versus 25%, at the expense of carbohydrate intake.37 Sixteen studies included dietary education, with participants choosing their own meals, while 11 supplied all or part of the diet. 1,13,19,23,29,33,34,37,43,47,49 Others did not require a specific dietary composition outside of the fasting period.

Studies were of limited size and duration: 18 of 27 trials analyzed fewer than 60 participants and were 12 weeks or fewer in duration. The longest studies lasted 1 year and had 137 to 244 participants. 17,28 Several studies had follow-up periods after the intervention ranging from 2 weeks to 1 year. 12,15,18,19,41-43,50

Weight loss

In all 27 trials (n=944 IF participants), IF resulted in weight loss, ranging from 0.8% to 13.0% of baseline body weight (Table 1). 10-50 Weight loss occurred regardless of changes in overall caloric intake. 43,53 In the 16 studies of 2 to 12 weeks' duration that measured BMI, BMI decreased, on average, by 4.3% to a median of 33.2 kg/m².^{10,12,13,19-21,23-25,29,34,35,37,47,50} Waist circumference decreased by 3 cm to 8 cm in studies longer than 4 weeks that recorded it. 13,21,23,24,27,33-35,37,41,42,47

Twelve studies used calorie-restricted diets as a comparator to IF and found equivalent weight loss in both groups. 11,15-17,19,22,27,28,33,41-43 Study duration was 8 weeks to 1 year, with a combined total of 1206 participants (527 undergoing IF, 572 using calorie restriction, and 107 control participants) and demonstrated weight loss of 4.6% to 13.0%. 11,15-17,19,22,27,28,33,41-43 Adherence appears similar for both weight loss strategies. 15,17,27,28 The largest study comparing IF with calorie restriction was by Headland et al in 2019 of 244 obese adults who achieved a mean 4.97kg weight loss over 52 weeks versus a mean weight loss of 6.65 kg with calorie-restricted diets (P=.24).²⁸

Table 1. Summary o	of IF st	udies: Total IF	participan	ts = 944.			
					WEIGHT LOSS, % OF		
STUDY, Y	N	POPULATION*	LEVEL OF EVIDENCE	DURATION	BASELINE WEIGHT	INTERVENTION†	KEY RESULT
Anton et al,¹º 2019	10	Obese, > 65 y	II	4 wk	2.2	16-h daily fast; self-reported	IF is feasible in older adults and leads to weight loss
Antoni et al, ¹¹ 2018	41	Overweight and obese	I	Until 5% weight loss is reached	5.3	2-d fast (25% of caloric needs) and 5-d ad libitum calorie intake vs CR; self-reported	59 d to achieve 5% weight loss with IF; not statistically different in CR group (73 d)
Arnason et al, ¹² 2017	10	Obese, T2D	II	2 wk	1.4	18- to 20-h daily fast as a goal, but average fast was 16.8 h; 2-wk follow- up; self-reported	Short-term IF might be safe in patients with T2D and might improve glycemic control
Bhutani et al, ¹³ 2013 Bhutani et al, ¹⁴ 2013	64	Obese	I	12 wk	3.2	Alternated 25% of caloric needs with ad libitum calorie intake vs usual diet with or without exercise; self- reported	IF in combination with exercise is more effective than either method alone
Bowen et al, ¹⁵ 2018	136	Overweight and obese	1	16 wk	10.6	3-d fast, 3-d CR, and 1-d ad libitum intake vs CR; 8-wk maintenance; self-reported	CR combined with IF does not improve on weight loss of CR alone
Carter et al, ¹⁶ 2016	51	Obese, T2D	I	12 wk	5.9	2-d fast (1670 to 2500 kJ/d) and 5-d usual diet vs CR; self- reported	IF is a viable alternative to CR for weight loss and glycemic control in T2D
Carter et al, ¹⁷ 2018 Carter et al, ¹⁸ 2019	137	Obese, T2D	I	52 wk	6.8	2-d fast (25% of usual calorie intake) and 5-d usual diet vs CR; 1-y follow-up; self-reported	Similar decrease in HbA _{1c} level and weight with IF or CR; weight is stable and HbA _{1c} level climbs in follow-up
Catenacci et al, ¹⁹ 2016	26	Obese	I	8 wk	8.7	Alternated 0% usual calorie intake with ad libitum intake vs CR; 24-wk follow-up; monitored	IF is a safe weight-loss strategy; no increase in risk of weight regain
Cho et al, ²⁰ 2019	31	Overweight and obese	I	8 wk	5.0	Alternated 25% usual calorie intake with ad libitum intake vs usual diet with or without exercise; self-reported	Exercise does not improve weight loss for IF alone
Corley et al, ²¹ 2018	41	Obese, T2D	II	12 wk	0.8	2-d fast (2 small snacks, 1 light meal) and 5-d ad libitum intake; self- reported	IF safe in T2D; promotes weight loss and glycemic control
Coutinho et al, ²² 2018	35	Obese	T	12 wk	13.0	3-d fast (25% of caloric needs) and 4-d full caloric needs vs CR; self-reported	Similar weight losses result from IF and CR
Eshghinia and Gapparov, ²³ 2011	26	Obese women	II	4 wk	4.9	3-d fast (25% to 40% of usual caloric intake) and 4-d CR (10% decrease in usual caloric intake) per wk; self-reported	Short-term IF with CR is a viable weight-loss strategy in obesity

Table 1 continued from page 120

STUDY, Y	N	POPULATION*	LEVEL OF EVIDENCE	DURATION	WEIGHT LOSS, % OF BASELINE WEIGHT	INTERVENTION [†]	KEY RESULT
Eshghinia and Mohammadzadeh, ²⁴ 2013	15	Obese women	II	6 wk	7.1	3-d fast (25% to 30% of caloric needs), 3-d usual diet, and 1-d ad libitum intake; self- reported	Short-term IF is a viable weight loss strategy in obesity
Gabel et al, ²⁵ 2018 Gabel et al, ²⁶ 2019	46	Obese	I	12 wk	3.2	16-h fast daily vs usual- diet historical controls; self-reported	IF leads to weight loss compared with baseline and control group
Harvie et al, ²⁷ 2011	107	Obese women	I	24 wk	7.9	2-d fast (very low- calorie intake) and 5-d usual diet vs CR; self- reported	IF is as effective as CR for weight loss and insulin sensitivity
Headland et al, ²⁸ 2019	244	Obese	I	52 wk	5.6	2-d fast (25% of usual calorie intake) and 5-d usual diet vs CR; self- reported	IF and CR have similar weight loss results at 1 y
Hoddy et al, ²⁹ 2014 Hoddy et al, ³⁰ 2015 Hoddy et al, ³¹ 2016 Hoddy et al, ³² 2016	59	Obese	I	8 wk	4.2	Alternated daily 25% of baseline caloric needs with ad libitum caloric intake; self-reported	IF is a safe weight-loss strategy; no increased risk of disordered eating; might decrease insulin resistance
Hutchison et al, ³³ 2019	88	Overweight and obese women	I	8 wk	4.6	3-d fast (32%-37% of energy requirements) and 4 d at 100% or 145% of energy requirements vs CR and control group; self- reported	Combining CR and IF is more effective for weight loss than either alone
Kahleova et al, ³⁴ 2014	54	Obese, T2D	I	12 wk	3.9	16-h daily fast vs CR; self-reported	IF is more effective than CR for weight loss and glycemic control in T2D
Klempel et al, ³⁵ 2012 Kroeger et al, ³⁶ 2012	54	Obese women	II	8 wk	3.4	1-d fast (very low- calorie intake) and 6-d CR; self-reported	IF combined with CR promotes weight loss in obese women
Klempel et al, ³⁷ 2013 Klempel et al, ³⁸ 2013 Klempel et al, ³⁹ 2013 Varady et al, ⁴⁰ 2015	32	Obese women	II	8 wk	4.5	Alternated 25% of usual calorie intake with 125% of usual calorie intake; high-fat vs low-fat diet; self- reported	IF is effective for weight loss with a high-fat or low-fat diet composition
Schübel et al, ⁴¹ 2018	150	Obese	I	12 wk	6.4	2-d fast (25% of calorie requirements) and 5-d usual diet vs CR and control group; 12-wk maintenance; 26-wk follow-up; self-reported	Weight loss and maintenance is similar in IF and CR
Sundfør et al, ⁴² 2018	112	Obese	I	26 wk	8.4	2-d fast (20% of calorie requirements) and 5-d usual diet vs CR; 26-wk maintenance; self- reported	Weight loss and maintenance are similar in IF and CR

Table 1 continued on page 122

Table 1 continued from page 121

STUDY, Y	N	POPULATION*	LEVEL OF EVIDENCE	DURATION	WEIGHT LOSS, % OF BASELINE WEIGHT	INTERVENTION [†]	KEY RESULT
Trepanowski et al, ⁴³ 2017 Trepanowski et al, ⁴⁴ 2018 Kroeger et al, ⁴⁵ 2018 Kalam et al, ⁴⁶ 2019	79	Obese	I	24 wk	6.0	Alternated 25% of usual calorie intake with 125% of usual calorie intake vs CR and control group; 24-wk follow-up; self-reported	IF promotes weight loss and weight maintenance similar to CR
Varady et al, ⁴⁷ 2009 Bhutani et al, ⁴⁸ 2010	16	Obese	II	8 wk	5.8	Alternated 25% of energy needs with ad libitum caloric intake; self-reported	IF is a viable option for weight loss in obese individuals
Varady et al, ⁴⁹ 2013	30	Obese	l	12 wk	6.5	Alternated 25% of baseline energy needs with ad libitum caloric intake vs usual diet; monitored	IF is effective for weight loss in obese individuals
Zuo et al, ⁵⁰ 2016	40	Obese	II	12 wk	10.0	1-d fast (430 kcal) and 6-d high-protein diet; 52-wk follow-up; monitored	IF with a high-protein diet is effective for weight loss, with low risk of weight regain

CR—calorie restriction, HbA_{1c} —hemoglobin A_{1c} , IF—intermittent fasting, T2D—type 2 diabetes.

Table 2. Outcomes of risk factors for cardiovascular disease and type 2 diabetes in 26 individual studies of 22 intermittent fasting trials enrolling obese adults without type 2 diabetes

\leftrightarrow	324	Examined in 16 studies, with no change in 9 studies ^{10,13,27,29,35,37,42,43,47}
\downarrow	226	Examined in 16 studies, with a decrease in 7 studies ^{11,15,21,24,25,49,50}
\downarrow	764	Decrease seen in 22 studies ^{10,11,13,15,19,20,22-25,27-29,33,35,37,41-43,49,47,50}
\downarrow	566	Decrease seen in the 16 studies measuring BMI ^{10,13,15,19,20,23-25,28,29,35,37,42,43,47,50}
\leftrightarrow	409	Examined in 17 studies, with no change in 11 studies ^{10,19,24,25,27,32,35,38,40,42,43}
\downarrow	192	Examined in 17 studies, with a decrease in 5 studies 13,15,20,23,41
↑	24	Examined in 17 studies, with an increase in 1 study ¹¹
\downarrow	54	Decrease seen in the 1 study measuring HbA _{1c} level ⁴²
\downarrow	407	Decrease in 8 studies, decreasing trend in 3 of 11 studies measuring insulin level ^{11,13,15,19,20,25,27,32,35,41,43}
	↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↑ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓	 ↓ 226 ↓ 764 ↓ 566 ↔ 409 ↓ 192 ↑ 24 ↓ 54 ↓ 407

BMI—body mass index, HbA_{1c}—hemoglobin A_{1c}

Table 3. Outcomes of risk factors for cardiovascular disease and type 2 diabetes in 5 intermittent fasting studies enrolling obese adults with type 2 diabetes

OUTCOME	N	STUDIES
NA	NA	Not studied in obese patients with type 2 diabetes
\downarrow	174	Decrease seen in all 5 studies ^{12,16,17,21,34}
\downarrow	174	Decrease seen in all 5 studies ^{12,16,17,21,34}
\downarrow	78	Decrease seen in the 3 studies measuring glucose level ^{12,21,34}
\downarrow	164	Decrease seen in the 4 studies measuring HbA _{1c} level ^{16,17,21,34}
\downarrow	27	Decrease seen in the 1 study measuring insulin level ³⁴
	NA	NA NA ↓ 174 ↓ 174 ↓ 78 ↓ 164

BMI—body mass index, HbA_{1c} —hemoglobin A_{1c} , NA—not available.

^{*}Where sex is not specified, both men and women were enrolled.

^{&#}x27;Self-reported indicates participants reported consumption in food diaries; monitored indicates investigators monitored participants' consumption.

All of the 11 other comparisons of IF and calorie-restriction diets also found similar results between both groups. 11,15-17,19,22,27,33,41-43 In several of these studies, those in the IF group consumed the same amount of calories^{22,41-43} or less^{19,27,33} than those in the calorie-restriction group. Four studies combined fasting and calorie restriction on the nonfasting days and found comparable weight loss to other studies (3.4% to 10.6%). 15,23,33,35 In a direct comparison of 88 participants over 8 weeks, IF combined with restricting calories to 30% less than their calculated energy requirements led to greater weight loss versus IF alone $(P \le .05)$.³³

Most of the weight loss with IF is fat loss. 13,17,19,20,22,28,29, ^{33,35,43,47,53} A 2011 study by Harvie et al calculated that 79% of weight loss was owing to loss of fat specifically (level I evidence).27 Participants regained some weight during follow-up after intervention, although average body weight remained statistically significantly lower than baseline levels. 15,18,19,41-43,50 Weight regain did occur after 6 months. Five studies followed participants for 6 months or longer after completing IF interventions of 8 weeks to 1 year and most studies saw body weight increase by 1% to 2% of their weight nadir. 18,19,41,43,50 Catenacci et al found a mean 2.6-kg regain over 6 months,19 and Schübel et al⁴¹ and Trepanowski et al⁴³ each found a regain of 2% of baseline body weight. The year-long study by Carter et al of 137 participants was the exception, demonstrating a maintained weight loss.18 Zuo et al saw a BMI increase of less than 1% during a year-long follow-up period after 12 weeks of IF.50 In 6 comparisons of IF and calorie restriction, the amount of weight regained after IF and calorie restriction was similar. 15,18,19,41-43 The 2016 study by Catenacci et al showed differing patterns of weight regain. In the 11 IF patients who completed follow-up, this was limited to lean body mass, while the 10 calorie-restricted patients who completed follow-up regained both fat and lean body mass.19

The practical length of a fast to effect changes in weight appears to be 16 hours. In IF studies with a daily fasting intervention, a total of 120 participants were able to maintain a minimum daily fast of about 16 hours (15.8 to 16.8 hours), with an 8-hour eating window each day. 10,12,25,34 Arnason et al found that participants were able to fast for an average of 16.8 hours per day, rather than the 18- to 20-hour goal they had set. 12 Combining exercise with IF improved weight loss in a 2013 study by Bhutani et al of 64 obese patients. They found weight loss doubled (6 kg) when exercise was added to IF (level I evidence). 13 In 2019, Cho et al found no improvement in weight loss when exercise was added to IF (n=31)(level I evidence).20 There were high dropout rates (≥25%) in several IF studies, 11,13,20,25,28,43,50 which compare poorly to the 12% to 14% dropout rates of other long-term diets: Atkins, Zone, LEARN (Lifestyle, Exercise, Attitudes, Relationships, and Nutrition), and Ornish.⁵⁴ In direct comparisons of IF to calorie restriction, the 2 have similar dropout rates.^{11,15-17,19,22,27,28,33,41-43} Across the IF

studies, adherence to fasting ranged from 77% to 98% (n=265).10,11,13,17,21,29,38 In a 2009 study, Varady et al found weight loss was directly related to percentage of adherent days per week (level II evidence).47

Intermittent fasting studies generally find that hunger levels remain stable^{22,31} or decrease during IF.^{38,45} A study of 30 participants over 12 weeks by Varady et al found reports of hunger during IF were no higher than with unrestricted consumption (level I evidence). 49 Kroeger et al found that among those with the highest weight losses over 12 weeks of IF, hunger decreased and fullness increased.45 In the study by Harvie et al, 15% of participants reported hunger.27 Sundfør et al saw higher reported hunger in the IF group compared with those in the calorie restriction group.⁴²

Ramadan is a culturally determined example of IF for many Muslims. Those who fast often do so for approximately 14 hours per day for 30 days, presenting a realworld opportunity for examining effects of fasting.55-62 Eight Ramadan studies examined weight loss in obese adults (n=856).55-62 Weight losses ranged from 0.1 kg58 to 1.8 kg⁶¹ (level II evidence). Studies enrolling participants with diabetes saw a modest improvement in glycemic control.58,60,62 Diabetes Canada issued detailed recommendations on management of patients with diabetes during Ramadan in February 2019.63 Their expert panel recommends individualized risk stratification, glucose monitoring, and treatment with medications with low hypoglycemia risk profiles.63

Diabetes

While IF is a moderately successful strategy for weight loss, it shows promise for improving glycemic control. Five studies exclusively enrolled individuals with type 2 diabetes (Table 3).12,16,17,21,34 Kahleova et al compared a daily fast of at least 16 hours to caloric restriction (n=54).³⁴ Both groups experienced decreases in insulin levels but IF participants had significantly lower fasting glucose levels (-0.78 mmol/L vs -0.47 mmol/L, P<.05). Increased oral glucose insulin sensitivity, decreased C-peptide levels, and decreased glucagon levels were also statistically significantly greater in the IF group. The decrease in hemoglobin A_{1c} level was similar between the IF and calorie-restricted groups—a 0.25% decrease over 12 weeks (level I evidence).34

In a 2016 pilot study, Carter et al implemented a fast 2 days per week with an otherwise usual diet versus caloric restriction every day in participants with diabetes (n=51).16 Medication use was reduced and hemoglobin A_{1c} levels decreased significantly (by 0.7%) during the 12-week study (P<.001), but the effect of IF on weight did not differ from that of caloric restriction (level I evidence).16 The 2018 trial that followed (n=137) saw the same result over 12 months of IF or calorie restriction (level I evidence). 17 The improvements in hemoglobin A₁₀ level were lost during the 12 months after IF, although

weight losses and medication reductions remained.18 In the 2017 Saskatchewan study by Arnason et al, 10 participants with type 2 diabetes fasted an average of 16.8 hours per day for 2 weeks.12 They found improved glycemic control with lower morning, postprandial, and average mean daily glucose levels (level II evidence). 12 These improvements regressed once participants returned to their usual diets. Corley et al enrolled 41 individuals with diabetes in a 2018 study of twice-weekly 1-day fasts for 12 weeks; fasting glucose levels decreased by 1.1 mmol/L and hemoglobin A₁₀ levels by 0.7% (level II evidence),21 a decline similar to that in the earlier study by Carter et al. 16 Kahleova et al found a more modest decrease in blood glucose levels (-0.78 mmol/L) with a daily 16-hour fast; no adverse events were reported.³⁴

Use of IF in patients with diabetes poses a risk of hypoglycemia. Olansky suggests adjusting medication in patients with type 2 diabetes taking insulin or insulin secretagogues (eg, sulfonylureas).64 Other hypoglycemic agents such as metformin, glucagonlike peptide 1 agonists, dipeptidyl peptidase 4 inhibitors, and α -glucosidase inhibitors are considered less likely to cause hypoglycemia (level III evidence).64 Olansky indicates that adjustments might not be required to long-acting basal insulin, but that short-acting analogues should be reduced on fasting days to reflect the timing of meals and anticipated carbohydrate intake (level III evidence). 64 Premixed insulins (ie, intermediate-acting and short-acting insulin) are not recommended during IF, as they are not adaptable to changes in meal timing and calories.64 Corley et al reduced any insulin use by up to 70% on fasting days.21 Hypoglycemic events (blood glucose level ≤4.0 mmol/L) in that study (n=41) were experienced on average every 43 days, with no severe hypoglycemic events (ie, requiring assistance of another person).21 Carter et al proposed lessening the risk of hypoglycemic events through pretrial discontinuation of all insulin and sulfonylureas when participants' baseline hemoglobin A_{1c} levels were less than 7%; discontinuation of insulin only on fast days if hemoglobin A_{1c} levels were between 7% and 10%; and no change in medication if hemoglobin A_{1c} levels were greater than 10%.16,65 This protocol was later modified to decrease long-acting insulin by 10 units while fasting.¹⁷ Arnason et al found no hypoglycemia among 10 participants with type 2 diabetes during a 2-week period with daily fasts averaging 16.8 hours; however, their study excluded those taking insulin.12

Adverse events

No serious adverse events were reported in the 27 IF trials. Fasting-related safety concerns include moodrelated side effects and binge eating, among other symptoms. Obese participants observing a fast every second day did not develop binge-eating patterns^{19,26} or purgative behaviour, 26,30 and reported improved body image and less depression.^{26,30} During the 6-month

study by Harvie et al, 32% of participants reported less depression and increased positive mood and selfconfidence.²⁷ Study participants also occasionally reported dizziness, 10,26,30,42 general weakness, 26,27,30,41 bad breath,30 headache,10,27,41,42 feeling cold,27,41 lack of concentration, 27,41 sleep disturbance, 42,30 nausea, 42 and constipation.27,30 When compared with baseline, these symptoms were unchanged with fasting.^{26,30}

Conclusion

Obesity treatment will always be a challenge in primary care. We have limited effective options to recommend to overweight and obese patients, many of whom have doubtless already participated in calorie-restricted diets. The heterogeneity in the current evidence limits comparison of IF to other weight-loss strategies. Intermittent fasting shows promise as a primary care intervention for obesity, but little is known about long-term sustainability and health effects. Longer-duration studies are needed to understand how IF might contribute to effective weight-loss strategies.

Mrs Welton is a researcher for the Anishinaabe Bimaadiziwin Research Program in Sioux Lookout, Ont. Dr Minty is a family physician practising at the Sioux Lookout Meno Ya Win Health Centre and Assistant Professor in the Division of Clinical Sciences at the Northern Ontario School of Medicine. Dr O'Driscoll is Assistant Professor in the Division of Clinical Sciences at the Northern Ontario School of Medicine in Sioux Lookout, Ms Willms is a research assistant in the Anishinaabe Bimaadiziwin Research Program. Ms Poirier is a primary care nurse at the Hugh Allan Clinic in Sioux Lookout. Dr Madden is Associate Professor in the Division of Clinical Sciences at the Northern Ontario School of Medicine in Sioux Lookout. Dr Kelly is a research consultant for the Sioux Lookout Meno Ya Win Health Centre.

All authors contributed to the concept and design of the study; data gathering, analysis, and interpretation; and preparing the manuscript for submission.

Competing interests

None declared

Correspondence

Dr Len Kelly; e-mail lkelly@mcmaster.ca

References

- Statistics Canada. Overweight and obese adults, 2018. Ottawa, ON: Government of Canada: 2018. Available from: https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/82-625-x/2019001/ article/00005-eng.htm. Accessed 2019 Jul 1.
- Pi-Sunyer FX. Comorbidities of overweight and obesity: current evidence and research issues. Med Sci Sports Exerc 1999;31(11 Suppl):S602-8.
- Guh DP, Zhang W, Bansback N, Amarsi Z, Birmingham CL, Anis AH. The incidence of comorbidities related to obesity and overweight: a systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Public Health 2009:9:88.
- 4. Howard BV, Manson JE, Stefanick ML, Beresford SA, Frank G, Jones B, et al. Low-fat dietary pattern and weight change over 7 years: the Women's Health Initiative Dietary Modification Trial. JAMA 2006;295(1):39-49.
- Collier R. Intermittent fasting: the science of going without. CMAJ 2013;185(9):E363-4. Epub 2013 Apr 8.
- Collier R. Intermittent fasting: the next big weight loss fad. CMAJ 2013;185(8):E321-2. Epub 2013 Mar 25.
- Pilon B. Eat, stop, eat. The shocking truth that makes weight loss simple again. Published by author; 2017.
- Fung J. The obesity code. Unlocking the secrets of weight loss. Vancouver, BC: Greystone Books: 2016.
- Mattson MP, Longo VD, Harvie M. Impact of intermittent fasting on health and disease processes. Ageing Res Rev 2017;39:46-58. Epub 2016 Oct 31.
- 10. Anton SD, Lee SA, Donahoo WT, McLaren C, Manini T, Leeuwenburgh C, et al. The effects of time restricted feeding on overweight, older adults: a pilot study. Nutrients 2019:11(7):1500.
- 11. Antoni R, Johnston KL, Collins AL, Robertson MD. Intermittent v. continuous energy restriction: differential effects on postprandial glucose and lipid metabolism following matched weight loss in overweight/obese participants. Br J Nutr 2018;119(5):507-16.
- 12. Arnason TG, Bowen MW, Mansell KD. Effects of intermittent fasting on health markers in those with type 2 diabetes: a pilot study. World J Diabetes 2017;8(4):154-64.
- Bhutani S, Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Varady KA. Alternate day fasting and endurance exercise combine to reduce body weight and favorably alter plasma lipids in obese humans. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2013;21(7):1370-9. Epub 2013 May 29.

- 14. Bhutani S, Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Phillips SA, Norkeviciute E, et al. Alternate day fasting with or without exercise: effects on endothelial function and adipokines in obese humans. ESPEN J 2013;8(5):e205-9.
- 15. Bowen J, Brindal E, James-Martin G, Noakes M. Randomized trial of a high protein partial meal replacement program with or without alternate day fasting: similar effects on weight loss, retention status, nutritional, metabolic, and behavioral outcomes Nutrients 2018:10(9):1145.
- 16. Carter S, Clifton PM, Keogh JB. The effects of intermittent compared to continuous energy restriction on glycaemic control in type 2 diabetes; a pragmatic pilot trial. Diabetes Res Clin Pract 2016;122:106-12. Epub 2016 Oct 19.
- 17. Carter S, Clifton PM, Keogh JB. Effect of intermittent compared with continuous energy restricted diet on glycemic control in patients with type 2 diabetes: a randomized noninferiority trial. JAMA Netw Open 2018;1(3):e180756.
- 18. Carter S, Clifton PM, Keogh JB. The effect of intermittent compared with continuous energy restriction on glycaemic control in patients with type 2 diabetes: 24-month follow-up of a randomised noninferiority trial. Diabetes Res Clin Pract 2019;151:11-9. Epub 2019 Mar 19.
- 19. Catenacci VA, Pan Z, Ostendorf D, Brannon S, Gozansky WS, Mattson MP, et al. A randomized pilot study comparing zero-calorie alternate-day fasting to daily caloric restriction in adults with obesity. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2016;24(9):1874-83.
- 20. Cho AR, Moon JY, Kim S, An KY, Oh M, Jeon JY, et al. Effects of alternate day fasting and exercise on cholesterol metabolism in overweight or obese adults: a pilot randomized controlled trial. Metabolism 2019;93:52-60. Epub 2019 Jan 4.
- 21. Corley BT, Carroll RW, Hall RM, Weatherall M, Parry-Strong A, Krebs JD. Intermittent fasting in type 2 diabetes mellitus and the risk of hypoglycaemia: a randomized controlled trial. Diabet Med 2018;35(5):588-94. Epub 2018 Feb 27.
- 22. Coutinho SR, Halset EH, Gåsbakk S, Rehfeld JF, Kulseng B, Truby H, et al. Compensatory mechanisms activated with intermittent energy restriction: a randomized control trial. Clin Nutr 2018;37(3):815-23. Epub 2017 Apr 7.
- 23. Eshghinia S, Gapparov MG. Effect of short-term modified alternate-day fasting on the lipid metabolism in obese women. Iranian J Diabetes Obes 2011;3(1):1-5
- 24. Eshghinia S, Mohammadzadeh F. The effects of modified alternate-day fasting diet on weight loss and CAD risk factors in overweight and obese women. J Diabetes Metab Disord 2013;12(1):4.
- 25. Gabel K, Hoddy KK, Haggerty N, Song J, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, et al. Effects of 8-hour time restricted feeding on body weight and metabolic disease risk factors in
- obese adults: a pilot study. *Nutr Healthy Aging* 2018;4(4):345-53.
 26. Gabel K, Hoddy KK, Varady KA. Safety of 8-h time restricted feeding in adults with obesity. Appl Physiol Nutr Metab 2019;44(1):107-9. Epub 2018 Sep 14.
- 27. Harvie MN, Pegington M, Mattson MP, Frystyk J, Dillon B, Evans G, et al. The effects of intermittent or continuous energy restriction on weight loss and metabolic disease risk markers: a randomized trial in young overweight women. Int J Obes (Lond) 2011;35(5):714-27. Epub 2010 Oct 5.
- 28. Headland ML, Clifton PM, Keogh JB. Effect of intermittent compared to continuous energy restriction on weight loss and weight maintenance after 12 months in healthy overweight or obese adults. Int J Obes (Lond) 2019;43(10):2028-36. Epub 2018 Nov 23. Erratum in: Int J Obes (Lond) 2019;43(4):942.
- 29. Hoddy KK, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Barnosky A, Bhutani S, Varady KA. Meal timing during alternate day fasting: impact on body weight and cardiovascular disease risk in obese adults. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2014;22(12):2524-31. Epub 2014 Sep 24. Erratum in: Obesity (Silver Spring) 2015;23(4):914.
- 30. Hoddy KK, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Barnosky AR, Bhutani S, Varady KA. Safety of alternate day fasting and effect on disordered eating behaviors. Nutr J 2015;14:44
- 31. Hoddy KK, Gibbons C, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Barnosky A, Bhutani S, et al. Changes in hunger and fullness in relation to gut peptides before and after 8 weeks of alternate day fasting. Clin Nutr 2016;35(6):1380-5. Epub 2016 Mar 30.
 32. Hoddy KK, Bhutani S, Phillips SA, Varady KA. Effects of different degrees of insulin
- resistance on endothelial function in obese adults undergoing alternate day fasting. Nutr Healthy Aging 2016;4(1):63-71.
- 33. Hutchison AT, Liu B, Wood RE, Vincent AD, Thompson CH, O'Callaghan NJ, et al. Effects of intermittent versus continuous energy intakes on insulin sensitivity and metabolic risk in women with overweight. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2019;27(1):50-8.
- 34. Kahleova H, Belinova L, Malinska H, Oliyarnyk O, Trnovska J, Skop V, et al. Eating two larger meals a day (breakfast and lunch) is more effective than six smaller meals in a reduced-energy regimen for patients with type 2 diabetes: a randomised crossover study. Diabetologia 2014;57(8):1552-60. Epub 2014 May 18. Erratum in: Diabetologia 2015;58(1):205.
- 35. Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Bhutani S, Trepanowski JF, Varady KA. Intermittent fasting combined with calorie restriction is effective for weight loss and cardio-protection in obese women. Nutr J 2012;11(1):98.
- 36. Kroeger CM, Klempel MC, Bhutani S, Trepanowski JF, Tangney CC, Varady KA. Improvement in coronary heart disease risk factors during an intermittent fasting/calorie restriction regimen: relationship to adipokine modulations. Nutr Metab (Lond) 2012:9(1):98.
- 37. Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Varady KA. Alternate day fasting (ADF) with a high-fat diet produces similar weight loss and cardio-protection as ADF with a low-fat diet. Metabolism 2013;62(1):137-43. Epub 2012 Aug 11.
- 38. Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Norkeviciute E, Goslawski M, Phillips SA, Varady KA. Benefit of a low-fat over high-fat diet on vascular health during alternate day fasting. Nutr Diabetes 2013;3:e71.
- 39. Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Varady KA. Alternate day fasting increases LDL particle size independently of dietary fat content in obese humans. Eur J Clin Nutr 2013;67:783-5. Epub 2013 Apr 24.
- 40. Varady KA, Dam VT, Klempel MC, Horne M, Cruz R, Kroeger CM, et al. Effects of weight loss via high fat vs. low fat alternate day fasting diets on free fatty acid profiles. Sci Rep 2015;5:7561. Erratum in: Sci Rep 2015;5:8806.
- 41. Schübel R, Nattenmüller J, Sookthai D, Nonnenmacher T, Graf ME, Riedl L, et al. Effects of intermittent and continuous calorie restriction on body weight and metabolism over 50 wk: a randomized controlled trial. Am J Clin Nutr 2018;108(5):933-45.
- 42. Sundfør TM, Svendsen M, Tonstad S. Effect of intermittent versus continuous energy restriction on weight loss, maintenance and cardiometabolic risk: a randomized 1-year trial. Nutr Metab Cardiovasc Dis 2018;28(7):698-706. Epub 2018 Mar 29.

- 43. Trepanowski JF, Kroeger CM, Barnosky A, Klempel MC, Bhutani S, Hoddy KK, et al. Effect of alternate-day fasting on weight loss, weight maintenance, and cardioprotection among metabolically healthy obese adults: a randomized clinical trial. JAMA Intern Med 2017:177(7):930-8.
- 44. Trepanowski JF, Kroeger CM, Barnosky A, Klempel M, Bhutani S, Hoddy KK, et al. Effects of alternate-day fasting or daily calorie restriction on body composition, fat distribution, and circulating adipokines: secondary analysis of a randomized controlled trial. Clin Nutr 2018;37(6 Pt A):1871-8. Epub 2017 Dec 5.
- 45. Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Klempel MC, Barnosky A, Bhutani S, Gabel K, et al. Eating behavior traits of successful weight losers during 12 months of alternate-day fasting: an exploratory analysis of a randomized controlled trial. Nutr Health 2018;24(1):5-10. Epub 2018 Jan 22.
- 46. Kalam F, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Gabel K, Song JH, Cienfuegos S, et al. Beverage intake during alternate-day fasting: relationship to energy intake and body weight. Nutr Health 2019;25(3):167-171. Epub 2019 Apr 14.
- 47. Varady KA, Bhutani S, Church EC, Klempel MC. Short-term modified alternate-day fasting: a novel dietary strategy for weight loss and cardioprotection in obese adults. Am J Clin Nutr 2009;90(5):1138-43. Epub 2009 Sep 30.
- 48. Bhutani S, Klempel MC, Berger RA, Varady KA. Improvements in coronary heart disease risk indicators by alternate-day fasting involve adipose tissue modulations. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2010;18(11):2152-9. Epub 2010 Mar 18.
- 49. Varady KA, Bhutani S, Klempel MC, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Haus JM, et al. Alternate day fasting for weight loss in normal weight and overweight subjects: a randomized controlled trial. Nutr J 2013;12(1):146.
- 50. Zuo L, He F, Tinsley GM, Pannell BK, Ward E, Arciero PJ. Comparison of high-protein intermittent fasting low-calorie diet and heart healthy diet for vascular health of the obese, Front Physiol 2016:7:350.
- 51. Health Canada. Eating well with Canada's Food Guide. A resource for educators and communicators. Ottawa, ON: Health Canada; 2011. Available from: http://www.hc-sc.gc.ca/ fn-an/alt_formats/hpfb-dgpsa/pdf/pubs/res-educat-eng.pdf. Accessed 2018 May 1.
- 52. Eckel RH, Jakicic J 3rd, Ard JD, de Jesus JM, Houston Miller N, Hubbard VS, et al. 2013 AHA/ACC guideline on lifestyle management to reduce cardiovascular risk: a report of the American College of Cardiology/American Heart Association Task Force on Practice Guidelines. Circulation 2014;129(25 Suppl 2):S76-99. Errata in: Circulation 2014;129(25 Suppl 2):S100-1, Circulation 2015;131(4):e326.
- 53. Varady KA, Hoddy KK, Kroeger CM, Trepanowski JF, Klempel MC, Barnosky A, et al. Determinants of weight loss success with alternate day fasting. Obes Res Clin Pract 2016:10(4):476-80, Epub 2015 Sep 15,
- 54. Gardner CD, Kiazand A, Alhassan S, Kim S, Stafford RS, Balise RR, et al. Comparison of the Atkins, Zone, Ornish, and LEARN diets for change in weight and related risk factors among overweight premenopausal women: the A TO Z Weight Loss Study: a randomized
- trial. JAMA 2007;297(9):969-77. Erratum in: JAMA 2007;298(2):178. 55. Aksungar FB, Sarikaya M, Coskun A, Serteser M, Unsal I. Comparison of intermittent fasting versus caloric restriction in obese subjects: a two year follow-up. J Nutr Health Aging 2017;21(6):681-5.
- 56. Alharbi TJ, Wong J, Markovic T, Yue D, Wu T, Brooks B, et al. Ramadan as a model of intermittent fasting: effects on body composition, metabolic parameters, gut hormones and ap-
- petite in adults with and without type 2 diabetes mellitus [abstract]. Obes Med 2017;6:15-7. 57. Bouida W, Beltaief K, Baccouche H, Sassi M, Dridi Z, Trabelsi I, et al. Effects of Ramadan fasting on aspirin resistance in type 2 diabetic patients. PLoS One 2018;13(3):e0192590.
- 58. El Toony LF, Hamad DA, Omar OM. Outcome of focused pre-Ramadan education on metabolic and glycaemic parameters in patients with type 2 diabetes mellitus. Diabetes
- Metab Syndr 2018;12(5):761-7. Epub 2018 Apr 25.
 59. Faris MAE, Madkour MI, Obaideen AK, Dalah EZ, Hasan HA, Radwan H, et al. Effect of Ramadan diurnal fasting on visceral adiposity and serum adipokines in overweight and obese individuals. Diabetes Res Clin Pract 2019;153:166-75. Epub 2019 May 28.
- 60. Hassanein M, Abdelgadir E, Bashier A, Rashid F, Saeed MA, Khalifa A, et al. The role of optimum diabetes care in form of Ramadan focused diabetes education, flash glucose monitoring system and pre-Ramadan dose adjustments in the safety of Ramadan fasting in high risk patients with diabetes. Diabetes Res Clin Pract 2019;150:288-95. Epub 2019 Jan 11.
- 61. López-Bueno M, González-Jiménez E, Navarro-Prado S, Montero-Alonso MA, Schmidt-RioValle J. Influence of age and religious fasting on the body composition of Muslim women living in a westernized context. Nutr Hosp 2015;31(3):1067-73.
- 62. Shao Y, Lim GJ, Chua CL, Wong YF, Yeoh ECK, Low SKM, et al. The effect of Ramadan fasting and continuing sodium-glucose co-transporter-2 (SGLT2) inhibitor use on ketonemia, blood pressure and renal function in Muslim patients with type 2 diabetes. Diabetes Res Clin Pract 2018;142:85-91. Epub 2018 May 24.
- 63. Bajaj HS, Abouhassan T, Ahsan MR, Arnaout A, Hassanein M, Houlden RL, et al. Diabetes Canada position statement for people with types 1 and 2 diabetes who fast during Ramadan. Can J Diabetes 2019;43(1):3-12. Epub 2018 Apr 27.
- 64. Olansky L. Strategies for management of intermittent fasting in patients with diabetes. Cleve Clin J Med 2016;84(5):357-8.
- 65. Carter S, Clifton PM, Keogh JB. Intermittent energy restriction in type 2 diabetes: a short discussion of medication management. World J Diabetes 2016;7(20):627-30.

This article has been peer reviewed. Cet article a fait l'objet d'une révision par des pairs. Can Fam Physician 2020;66:117-25